

FACULTY OF MEDICINE, DENTISTRY AND HEALTH SCIENCES

Triennial Performance Review Panels - Level E

Discussion Outline



Key documents informing discussions:

- Staff member's completed online PDR form (including attachments e.g. CV)
- The Faculty [Academic Performance Framework](#) (relevant ACBI on page 18, 24 or 29)
- [The leadership roles of Melbourne professors](#)
- [Performance Relative to Opportunity \(PRO\) guidelines](#)

1. Summary by Supervisor

Provide a brief summary of the staff member's:

- Key areas of strengths/challenges over the last 3 years
- Opportunities for improvement
- Demonstration of Faculty Values

2. Panel discussion with supervisor

(10 min)

- **Panel's assessment of potential ratings** across the relevant areas of the APF:
 - Exceeding expectations
 - Meeting expectations
 - Not meeting expectations
- **Key areas identified for constructive feedback:**
 - Strengths: Example of strengths
 - Areas for Growth: Example of growth areas
 - Suggestions or additions to these points
- **Confirm Key Feedback**
 - Chair/HRBP to summarise notes

Next...

If staff member **IS** attending, go to the next step

If staff member **NOT** attending, skip step 3, and go to Step 4

3. Panel discussion with supervisor and staff member

(10 min)

Time guide: Keep constructive feedback concise <ul style="list-style-type: none">• 3 minutes for strengths• 3 minutes for growth areas• 4 minutes for questions from the Staff Member	Chair will lead discussion: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Chair will welcome the Staff Member and provide an overview.• Chair will address the detailed feedback on performance,• Chair to wrap up with next steps and clarify any final questions.
---	---

- Frame feedback constructively and focus on growth.
- Maintain a professional yet supportive tone throughout the meeting.
- Always focus on development and future opportunities rather than simply reviewing past performance.
 - **Instead of:** 'You're not doing enough in X area.'
 - **Try:** 'In order to improve in X, we recommend focusing on [specific action].'

Zoom meeting Action: HRBP/HRC to admit staff member from waiting room

Chair: Welcome, and thanks for joining us today to receive a high-level overview of your performance review.

- We're mindful of the time and want to ensure we cover everything thoroughly.
- We'll start by sharing some of the key strengths we've noted and then move into some areas where we see potential for further development to support your career goals in the coming year.
- At the end there will be a chance for you to ask any questions or share thoughts.
- If we run out of time and can't address all the details today, [supervisor name] will meet with you, in the next week or so to:
 - Go over your TPR and panel feedback in more detail,
 - where they can clarify or address any further questions you may have then.

Example Feedback – Strengths (1 minute)

- We've been very impressed with your work in [specific areas of achievement].
- For example, your leadership in [specific project or initiative] has been exemplary.
- We also appreciate your [mention additional strengths]. Your contributions to the department have been a significant asset.

Example Feedback – Areas for Growth (2 minutes)

- There are a few areas where we think further development could support your continued success.
- For example, in [specific area], there's an opportunity to [how improvement can be achieved, e.g., work more closely with junior staff on mentoring].
- We'd love to see you focus on [specific developmental actions].
- Another area we'd like to address is [another growth area].
- By focusing on [specific suggestion], you could have an even greater impact in the years to come.

Staff Member Engagement (2 minutes)

- **Chair:** We value your input, so what are your thoughts on the feedback we've shared so far? Is there anything you'd like to clarify or ask about?

4. Close/Next Steps - Panel with supervisor and staff (5 min)

Chair: Wrap up – addressing both supervisor and staff

- In making sure there's a clear path forward; your supervisor will arrange a follow-up meeting with you to go through any further details or questions you might have.
- They will review specific areas for development with you, and
- ensure that you have the resources you need for success.

Next Steps for Supervisor:

- Ensure a follow-up meeting is held, preferably within a week or so, but by the end of the month to go over the staff members' development plan.
- Agree on follow through actions post-review
- Finalise the ACM form and submit by the end of April.
- [HR Business Partner – *HRBP in attendance*] will reach out over the next month to check in.
- Thank you again for your hard work and contributions.
- We look forward to continuing to support you as you grow and achieve your goals.

End of Meeting

Education and Research / Research Level E (please also refer to the University ACBI)

Benchmark	<p>Level E Education and Research staff typically demonstrate outstanding performance and achievements in the domains of research, education, and leadership and service.</p> <p>Research – As eminent leaders in their discipline and scholars of international standing, Level E Education and Research staff deliver original, path-setting research of international and national significance and wide-ranging contributions to the advancement of fields of study that are informed and enhanced by engagement practices and partnerships. They lead applications for, and secure, substantial resources to sustain teams of researchers; they also provide influential leadership of cross-disciplinary research projects and teams and foster the research and scholarship of others. Level E Education and Research staff may also make significant and high-quality contributions to the scholarship of teaching and learning and/or educational research.</p> <p>Education – Level E Education and Research staff make varied contributions to education with reference to teaching practices, resource development and engagement and partnerships. The expectations below are indicative of the varied contributions but are neither minimum expectations, nor statements of all contributions that can be made. They engage in educational professional development, including peer review of teaching, and take an evidence-informed approach to improvement of teaching and learning practices to support strong educational outcomes and impact.</p> <p>Leadership and Service – Level E Education and Research staff provide influential leadership that advances research, education, engagement and administration through their department, school or interdisciplinary area, as well as the governance and collegial life inside and outside the institution. Level E Education and Research staff serve as leaders of strategic and cultural change within the institution and as ambassadors for the faculty and University, advancing the capacity, sustainability and standing of both.</p> <p>Level E Research Focused staff, while focused primarily on research, should contribute to leadership and service and are strongly encouraged to also make some contribution to education.</p>		
Performance Dimension	Research	Education	Leadership and Service
University Academic and Career Benchmarks and Indicator Goals	<p>Outstanding performance and pre-eminence as a scholar of international standing, meeting or surpassing the University benchmarks of:</p>		
Activities and Engagement <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The overall volume and range of academic activities, contributions and outputs</i> <i>The patterns of scholarly engagement beyond the academy with communities, industries and public policy</i> 	<p>Scholarly Outputs</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Internationally recognised portfolio of influential primary and collaborative publications in a manner expected in the discipline (the number of publications will vary with discipline and nature of research). Leadership and co-leadership of research projects and broader programs and a substantial and consistent number of senior authorships or demonstrable major contributions to highly influential publications. Alternative pathways to impact are also expected to be relevant (see below). <p>Research Grants and Other Research Income</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Well-established portfolio of funding as chief and co-investigator on external competitive grants. Often this would be sufficient income to sustainably lead a substantial team of externally-funded academic research staff, including those progressing their own careers, or to contribute substantially toward a larger team-based research program. May be seeking personal senior Fellowship funding. <p>Graduate Research Supervision</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Principal supervisor of 2–3 graduate research students. Timely completion of PhD students under supervision. Member of at least one advisory panel for graduate research student not under own supervision. <p>Engagement, Partnerships and Pathways to Impact</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demonstrating entrepreneurship and engagement with disciplinary communities and government, business, professional or community organisations to enhance excellence in research and research training. Collaborative development and conduct of public- focused research programs with national and international partnerships beyond the academy. <p>Research and research training contributions are agreed at appointment and may be varied at the annual performance review.</p> <p>Conducting research activities in a manner consistent with the University and Faculty values at all times is required to meet expectations.</p>	<p>Involvement in Teaching</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Active contribution to teaching and subject coordination. Design and direct involvement in student assessment. Design and direct involvement in student feedback. Provision of empathetic support and guidance for students including advising and mentoring. <p>Curriculum Materials and Educational Resources</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Leadership of planning, development and evaluation of curriculum and educational resources for a subject, course or degree. <p>Engagement and Partnerships</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Emerging entrepreneurship and engagement with government, professions or international communities to enhance excellence in teaching and learning. For example: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Curriculum design and delivery. Extra-curricular activities contributing to the achievement of graduate outcomes. Work integrated learning. Collaborative practice. Initiatives that advance student equity, diversity and wellbeing. <p>Participation in Educational Professional Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Documented participation in professional development activity to support personal continuing development in teaching and learning. <p>Education contributions are agreed at appointment and may be varied at the annual performance review.</p> <p>Conducting education activities in a manner consistent with the University and Faculty values at all times is required to meet expectations.</p>	<p>Citizenship and Values</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conducting research, education, and leadership and service activities in a manner consistent with the University and Faculty values at all times. Strong record of development of more junior colleagues with ongoing significant role in mentoring of others and exemplary role model in the workplace. Demonstration of the University's expectations for appropriate behaviour including respect, and upholding the University's commitment to a safe, diverse and inclusive workplace. Compliance with University statutes, delegations, policies and processes. <p>Service</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Leading substantial contributions within Department, School and/or Faculty. Positive engagement in teams and learning and career development of self and others. Mentor of staff and students (formal, informal, or a coordinator of or contributor to a mentoring program). <p>External Engagement and Public Value</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demonstrable entrepreneurship and engagement with government, business, professions or communities. Leader in discipline/field nationally and internationally. <p>University Leadership and Management</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demonstrable involvement and leadership in Departmental/School/Faculty committees or organisational activities. Exemplary role model in relationships with students, professional staff and academics at all levels, and in the effective development of others. <p>Contributions to Sustainable Advances in the University's Capability</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contributing in a meaningful way to university wide committees or initiatives. <p>Leadership and service contributions are agreed at appointment and may be varied at the annual performance review.</p>

Education Specialist Level E (please also refer to the University ACBI)

Benchmark	<p>Level E Education Specialist staff demonstrate outstanding performance and achievements in the domains of education, and leadership and service. As eminent leaders in their discipline and scholars of international standing, they deliver inspirational teaching and make major original, innovative and distinguished contributions to scholarship, teaching and the quality of the student experience, student learning and student outcomes that are underpinned by scholarship and engagement. They provide influential leadership that advances teaching, learning, engagement and administration through their department, school or interdisciplinary area, as well as the governance and collegial life inside and outside of the institution. They lead applications for and secure teaching innovation grant income; they also provide influential leadership of cross-disciplinary teaching and learning projects and teams and foster the scholarship of others. Level E Education Specialist staff serve as leaders of strategic and cultural change within the institution and ambassadors for the faculty and University, advancing the capacity, sustainability and standing of both. They engage in educational professional development, including peer review of teaching, and take an evidence-informed approach to improvement of teaching and learning practices to support strong educational outcomes and impact.</p>		
Performance Dimension	Education	Research and Research Training	Leadership and Service
University Academic and Career Benchmarks and Indicator Goals	Performance of exceptional distinction and achievements that are recognised as distinguished internationally or nationally, meeting the university benchmarks of:		
	Inspirational teaching and major contributions to the student experience, student learning and student outcomes that are underpinned by research, scholarship and engagement	Original, path-setting research of international and national significance	Citizenship, service and leadership for sustained change and improved capability within departments, faculties and the University overall. Leadership and service with communities and industries and policy engagement of public value.
Activities and Engagement <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The overall volume and range of academic activities, contributions and outputs The patterns of scholarly engagement beyond the academy with communities, industries and public policy 	<p>Involvement in Teaching</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Active contribution to teaching and subject coordination. Design and direct involvement in student assessment. Design and direct involvement in student feedback. Provision of empathetic support and guidance for students including advising and mentoring. <p>Curriculum Materials and Educational Resources</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Leadership of planning, development and evaluation of curriculum and educational resources for a subject, course or degree. <p>Engagement and Partnerships</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Emerging entrepreneurship and engagement with government, professions or international communities to enhance excellence in teaching and learning. For example: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Curriculum design and delivery. Extra-curricular activities contributing to the achievement of graduate outcomes. Work integrated learning. Collaborative practice. Initiatives that advance student equity, diversity and wellbeing. <p>Participation in Educational Professional Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Documented participation in professional development activity to support personal continuing development in teaching and learning. <p>Education contributions are agreed at appointment and may be varied at the annual performance review.</p> <p>Conducting education activities in a manner consistent with the University and Faculty values at all times is required to meet expectations.</p>	<p>Contribution to research and research training activity, engagement and quality and impact where relevant</p>	<p>Citizenship and Values</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conducting research, education, and leadership and service activities in a manner consistent with the University and Faculty values at all times. Strong record of development of more junior colleagues with ongoing significant role in mentoring of others and exemplary role model in the workplace. Demonstration of the University's expectations for appropriate behaviour, including respect, and upholding the University's commitment to a safe, diverse and inclusive workplace. Compliance with University statutes, delegations, policies and processes. <p>Service</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Leading substantial contributions within Department, School and/or Faculty. Positive engagement in teams and learning and career development of self and others. Mentor of staff and students (formal, informal, coordinator of or contributor to mentoring program). <p>External Engagement and Public Value</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demonstrable entrepreneurship and engagement with government, business, professions or communities. Leader in discipline/field nationally or internationally.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality, Impact and Influence Indicators of scholarly excellence, originality and recognition by the academy Indicators of impact and influence beyond the academy Indicators of contributions of public value 	<p>Evaluation of Teaching</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contribution to peer review of teaching as both reviewee and reviewer. <p>Evidence of Educational Outcomes and Impact</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Portfolio of relevant quantitative and qualitative measures of teaching quality. Measures may include peer review of teaching, the End of Semester Survey, the Mid Semester Survey, formative, self-led survey results, focus group data, industry and community reports, engagement data, student achievement etc. <p>Evidence-Informed Improvement of Education Practices</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demonstration of developments in learning and teaching practices in response to impact measures from own teaching. Demonstration of developments in learning and teaching practices informed by educational research, guidelines and communities of practice. <p>Recognition of Educational Expertise and Influence</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demonstrating an international leadership profile in education. This may be through peer review of education publications, contributions to learning and teaching communities of practice, adoption of innovations by peers, peer recognition of teaching and learning excellence, learning and teaching leadership roles, mentoring and support of colleagues, Participation on educational journal boards, leadership of teaching teams, provision of professional development, leading of international educational societies and communities of practice, invited international keynote presentations, international recognition as assessor or expert, university-level peer reviewing as a member of the College of Reviewers, leadership of learning and teaching committees, contributions to national and international statements on learning and teaching etc. Faculty/University National/International awards or prizes for teaching and learning. Teaching and learning innovation grant income. 		<p>University Leadership and Management</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demonstrable involvement and leadership in Departmental/School/Faculty committees or organisational activities. Exemplary role model in relationships with students, professional staff and academics at all levels, and in the effective development of others. <p>Contributions to Sustainable Advances in the University's Capability</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contributing in a meaningful way to university wide committees or initiatives. Leadership and service contributions are agreed at appointment and may be varied at the annual performance review.

Academic Specialist Level E (please also refer to the University ACBI)

Benchmark	<p>Level E Academic Specialists typically demonstrate outstanding performance and achievements in the domains of leadership and service, and research and research training, and/or education. They provide influential leadership that advances research and/or education, engagement and administration through their department, school or interdisciplinary area, as well as to the governance and collegial life inside and outside the institution. As scholars of international standing, they deliver original and wide-ranging contributions of international and national significance, including through leading entrepreneurship and engagement practices and partnerships nationally and internationally. They often lead applications for, and secure, internal and external income and may serve as a principal or co-supervisor of graduate researcher students. They provide influential leadership of cross-disciplinary research projects and teams and foster the scholarship and development of others. Level E Academic Specialists also serve as leaders of strategic and cultural change within the institution and as ambassadors for the faculty and University, advancing the capacity, sustainability and standing of both. 'Standard' expectations below must be interpreted in the context of individual position descriptions and the bespoke nature of Academic Specialist roles.</p>		
Performance Dimension	Leadership and Service	Research	Education
University Academic and Career Benchmarks and Indicator Goals	<p>Outstanding performance and pre-eminence as a scholar of international standing, meeting or surpassing the University benchmarks of:</p>		
Activities and Engagement <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The overall volume and range of academic activities, contributions and outputs The patterns of scholarly engagement beyond the academy with communities, industries and public policy 	<p>Citizenship and Values</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conducting research, education, and leadership and service activities in a manner consistent with the University and Faculty values at all times. Strong record of development of more junior colleagues with ongoing significant role in mentoring of others and as an exemplary role model in the workplace. Demonstration of the University's expectations for appropriate behaviour including respect and upholding the University's commitment to a safe, diverse and inclusive workplace. Compliance with University statutes, delegations, policies and processes. <p>Service</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Exemplary engagement in teams and learning and in the career development of self and others. Providing substantial leadership of other academic specialists and related support staff. Substantial impactful service to, and leadership of, discipline or wider university capability at department, school, faculty or University level (for example committee membership, coordination role). <p>External Engagement and Public Value</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Impactful engagement with, and influential leadership within, relevant local, national and international groups that facilitate quality of academic specialist activities. <p>University Leadership and Management</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Engaging across expertise and discipline within the University. Substantial impactful involvement in University-level committees or working groups. <p>Contributions to Sustainable Advances in the University's Capability</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Leading maintenance and development of relevant technical capabilities across the University and ensuring capabilities are nationally and internationally networked where relevant. 	<p>Original, path-setting research of international and national significance.</p> <p>Scholarly Outputs</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of leading impactful publications/reports/ guidelines/other outputs within specialist area. Substantial portfolio of influential publications or other relevant outputs led by other academics. Alternative pathways to impact may be relevant (see below). Contributions to research and research training programs, projects and teams (including through: technical research support or advice; providing research technology; research project management; laboratory management; or supporting research translation) are recognised as critical elements of research success. Engaged internationally in collaboration in specialist area benefitting the University. <p>Research Grants and Other Research Income</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Substantial record of contributions to funded major grants led by junior and senior academics (eg. through technical advice and support) and also as a co- or principal investigator on funded grants. Where relevant, a record of leading successful applications for funding of research infrastructure. <p>Graduate Research Supervision</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Likely engaged in providing technical support or expertise for graduate researchers. Record of successful direct supervision of graduate research students. <p>Engagement, Partnerships and Pathways to Impact</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Substantial evidence for facilitating the impact of other academics through provision of specialist support for research or its translational impact. High level entrepreneurship and local engagement with disciplinary communities and government, business, professional or community organisations to enhance excellence in research and research training. <p>Research and research training contributions may be minimal or substantial and are agreed at appointment and may be varied at the annual performance review.</p> <p>Conducting research activities in a manner consistent with the University and Faculty values at all times is required to meet expectations.</p>	<p>Inspirational teaching and major contributions to the student experience, student learning and student outcomes that are underpinned by research, scholarship and engagement.</p> <p>Involvement in Teaching</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Active contribution to teaching and subject coordination. Design and direct involvement in student assessment. Design and direct involvement in student feedback. Provision of empathetic support and guidance for students including advising and mentoring. <p>Curriculum Materials and Educational Resources</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Leadership of planning, development and evaluation of curriculum and educational resources for a subject, course or degree. <p>Engagement and Partnerships</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Emerging entrepreneurship and engagement with government, professions or international communities to enhance excellence in teaching and learning. For example: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Curriculum design and delivery. Extra-curricular activities contributing to the achievement of graduate outcomes. Work integrated learning. Collaborative practice. Initiatives that advance student equity, diversity and wellbeing. <p>Participation in Educational Professional Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Documented participation in professional development activity to support personal continuing development in teaching and learning. <p>Education contributions are agreed at appointment and may be varied at the annual performance review.</p> <p>Conducting education activities in a manner consistent with the University and Faculty values at all times is required to meet expectations.</p>
Quality, Impact and Influence <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Indicators of scholarly excellence, originality and recognition by the academy Indicators of impact and influence beyond the academy Indicators of contributions of public value 		<p>Significance and Innovation within the Academy (Expected to be at a level of international recognition of capability at Level E)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consistently demonstrating effective contributions in specialist area to the quality, impact and public value of a growing number of research and research training programs, projects and teams having national and international impact. <p>and/or</p> <p>Impact and Influence of Research Beyond the Academy</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consistently facilitating translation of research of other academics into demonstrable real-world impact/knowledge translation. Demonstrable impact on research and research training programs, projects and teams with national and international influence. 	<p>Evaluation of Teaching</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contribution to peer review of teaching as both reviewee and reviewer. <p>Evidence of Educational Outcomes and Impact</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Portfolio of relevant quantitative and qualitative measures of teaching quality. Measures may include peer review of teaching, the End of Semester Survey, the Mid Semester Survey, formative, self-led survey results, focus group data, industry and community reports, engagement data, student achievement etc. <p>Evidence-Informed Improvement of Education Practices</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demonstration of developments in learning and teaching practices in response to impact measures from own teaching. Demonstration of developments in learning and teaching practices informed by educational research, guidelines and communities of practice. <p>Recognition of Educational Expertise and Influence</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> [Relevant for Academic Specialists with a substantial involvement in teaching] Demonstrating an international leadership profile in education. This may be through peer review of education publications, contributions to learning and teaching communities of practice, adoption of innovations by peers, peer recognition of teaching and learning excellence, learning and teaching leadership roles, mentoring and support of colleagues, participation on educational journal boards, leadership of teaching teams, provision of professional development, leading of international educational societies and communities of practice, invited international keynote presentations, international recognition as assessor or expert, university-level peer reviewing as a member of the College of Reviewers, leadership of learning and teaching committees, contributions to national and international statements on learning and teaching etc. Faculty/University/National/International awards or prizes for teaching and learning. Teaching and learning innovation grant income.